Zintl, *et al.*,<sup>1</sup> found evidence from potentiometric titrations in liquid ammonia solutions for a number of compounds involving group IV and V elements in unusual oxidation states. The compounds suggested were

		$Na_4Pb_7$
	Na <sub>4</sub> Sn <sub>9</sub>	$Na_4Pb_9$
Na <sub>3</sub> As	Na₃Sb	$Na_3Bi$
Na <sub>3</sub> As <sub>8</sub>	Na <sub>3</sub> Sb <sub>3</sub>	$Na_3Bi_3$
Na3As5		Na <sub>8</sub> Bi <sub>5</sub>
Na <sub>3</sub> As <sub>7</sub>	$Na_3Sb_7$	

It was suggested that these could be thought of as the most negative possible ions (e.g.,  $Pb^{-4}$  or  $As^{-8}$ ) surrounded by 2, 4, 6, or 8 neutral atoms, but no detailed structural suggestions were put forth. They determined the sodium:heavy element ratio, so that  $Na_3As_8$ , for example, is more correctly formulated (NaAs)<sub>x</sub>. With the trivial exceptions of  $Na_3As$ ,  $Na_3Sb$ , and  $Na_3Bi$ , none of the electronic arrangements in these compounds is known. More recently, Marsh and Shoemaker<sup>2</sup> determined the crystal structure of NaPb, a compound not on the above list, and found tetrahedral  $Pb_4^{-4}$  groups. They suggested the possibility of two tetrahedra sharing a corner for  $Pb_7^{-4}$  and three tetrahedra

Both of the structures suggested for  $Pb_9^{-4}$  can be argued against. The eightfold coordination of  $Pb^0$ around  $Pb^{-4}$  suggested by Zintl involves two drastically different kinds of lead atoms, which seems unlikely. The  $Pb_4^{-4}$  ion found by Marsh and Shoemaker has an electronic arrangement that is more or less normal, similar to that of  $P_4$ , while the proposed  $Pb_9^{-4}$ , consisting of three tetrahedra cyclically arranged, does not. The lack of a normal bonding arrangement does not make this proposal incorrect but it does say that the proposal does not follow from the  $Pb_4^{-4}$  arrangement.

It is suggested here that the structure of the  $Pb_9^{-4}$ ion can be assigned by analogy to be the same as that of  $Bi_9^{+5}$ . Hershaft and Corbett<sup>3</sup> determined the crystal structure of "bismuth monochloride" (actually  $[Bi_9][BiCl_6]_4[Bi_2Cl_8]$ , the stoichiometry is  $Bi_6Cl_7$ ) in which they found  $Bi_9^{+5}$  groups of  $D_{3h}$  symmetry with all Bi atoms approximately equidistant from the center of the group. The structure is shown in Fig. 1.

(1) E. Zintl, J. Goubeau, and W. Dullenkopf, Z. physik. Chem., A154, 1 (1931).

(2) R. E. Marsh and D. P. Shoemaker, Acta Cryst., 6, 197 (1953).

(3) A. Hershaft and J. D. Corbett, J. Chem. Phys., 36, 551 (1962).



Fig. 1.—Probable shape of the  $Pb_9^{-4}$  ion. With the exception of the vertical lines the lines shown connect nearest neighbors. The threefold axis of the figure is shown.

The Bi<sub>9</sub><sup>+5</sup> group is isoelectronic with the Pb<sub>9</sub><sup>-4</sup> group, and it seems very likely, therefore, that it is also isostructural. A qualitative one-electron LCAO molecular orbital treatment<sup>4</sup> of the twenty-seven p-orbitals on the nine atoms shows that a reasonable arrangement of eleven pairs can be found. Since no quantitative calculations were made, it does not seem worthwhile to include the details here.

If this structure is correct, it would suggest that structures for the other ions Zintl found might be among the compact spherical arrangements possible<sup>5</sup> for five<sup>6</sup> and seven spheres.

Acknowledgment.—The author wishes to thank the National Science Foundation for support.

(4) For example, see the treatment of  $B_{12}^{-2}$  by W. N. Lipscomb and D. Britton, *ibid.*, **33**, 275 (1960), or J. R. Canon and G. H. Duffey, *ibid.*, **35**, 1657 (1961).

(5) See, for example, R. J. Gillespie, Can. J. Chem., 38, 818 (1960).

(6) For the ions  $As_6^{-3}$  and  $Bi_8^{-3}$  another more attractive possibility is that these should be  $As_{10}^{-6}$  and  $Bi_{10}^{-6}$ , in which case the  $P_4O_6$  structure is the obvious answer.

DEPARTMENT OF CHEMISTRY UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA MINNEAPOLIS, MINNESOTA DOVLE BRITTON

RECEIVED JUNE 29, 1963