

# Best Approximate Integration Formulas and Best Error Bounds

By Don Secrest

1. **Introduction.** Let  $f(x)$  be a member of the class of functions

$$(1.1) \quad F_n[x_1, x_m] = \{f(x) \mid f \in C^{n-1}[x_1, x_m], f^{(n-1)} \text{ absolutely continuous, } f^{(n)} \in L^2(x_1, x_m)\}.$$

Further, let  $f(x_i) = f_i, i = 1, \dots, m$ . We shall refer to the points,  $(x_i, f_i)$ , as the *fixed points*. We wish to find an optimal approximation to the integral

$$(1.2) \quad F(f) = \int_{x_1}^{x_m} f(x) dx.$$

We shall assume a bound  $M$  on the  $n$ th derivative of  $f$  of the form,

$$(1.3) \quad \int_{x_1}^{x_m} [f^{(n)}(x)]^2 dx \leq M.$$

This is a pseudonorm which may be derived from the bilinear form

$$(1.4) \quad [f, g] = \int_{x_1}^{x_m} f^{(n)}(x)g^{(n)}(x) dx.$$

Following Golomb and Weinberger [1], we introduce a new bilinear form

$$(1.5) \quad (f, g) = [f, g] + \sum_{i=1}^n f(x_i)g(x_i).$$

In this way we obtain a true norm since the quadratic form,  $(f, f)$ , is positive definite if  $m \geq n$ . If  $m$  is not greater than or equal to  $n$  we cannot form a norm in this way. Now we may write

$$(1.6) \quad (f, f) \leq r^2 \equiv M + \sum_{i=1}^n f_i^2.$$

We may now express any function  $f$  which passes through the *fixed points* as

$$(1.7) \quad f = \bar{u} + \frac{F(f) - F(\bar{u})}{F(\bar{y})} \bar{y} + w,$$

where  $\bar{u}$  is the function of smallest norm through the *fixed points*,  $\bar{y}$  is the function such that  $(\bar{y}, \bar{y}) = 1$  and  $y(x_i) = 0, i = 1, \dots, m$ ,

$$(1.8) \quad F(\bar{y}) = \sup\{|F(v)| \mid (v, v) = 1; v(x_i) = 0, i = 1, \dots, m\},$$

and  $w$  is the remainder. Golomb and Weinberger [1] have shown that  $(\bar{u}, \bar{y}) = 0$ ,  $(\bar{u}, w) = 0$  and  $(\bar{y}, w) = 0$ . Thus

$$(1.9) \quad r^2 \geq (f, f) \geq (\bar{u}, \bar{u}) + \left(\frac{F(f) - F(\bar{u})}{F(\bar{y})}\right)^2$$

---

Received February 20, 1964. Revised June 26, 1964.

or

$$(1.10) \quad F(\bar{u}) - F(\bar{y})(r^2 - (\bar{u}, \bar{u}))^{1/2} \leq F(f) \leq F(\bar{u}) + F(\bar{y})(r^2 - (\bar{u}, \bar{u}))^{1/2}.$$

Thus the optimal approximation to  $f$  is  $\bar{u}$ . This does not depend on the particular linear functional,  $F$ , we wish to approximate.

**2. Determination of  $\bar{u}$  and  $\bar{y}$ .** The function,  $\bar{u}$ , which minimizes

$$(2.1) \quad (f, f) = \int_{x_1}^{x_m} [f^{(n)}(x)]^2 dx + \sum_{i=1}^n f^2(x_i)$$

and passes through the *fixed points* is the function which minimizes the integral in (2.1) as the sum is a constant for any such function. This problem was solved in [2] for the case  $n = 2$  and later in [3] for any  $n$ . They show that  $\bar{u}$  is the spline function of order  $2n - 1$ . A spline function is defined as follows:

(a) The spline of order  $r$ ,  $S_r$ , is a polynomial of degree  $r$  in the intervals

$$(-\infty, x_1), [x_1, x_2), \dots, [x_m, \infty).$$

(b)  $S_r$  has continuous derivatives through the  $(r - 1)$ st. Thus for any  $f$  in  $F_n[x_1, x_m]$  passing through the *fixed points* the spline function  $S_{2n-1}$  is the optimal approximant for computing the values of linear functionals. The best approximation to the integral (1.2) is the integral of  $S_{2n-1}$ . It is shown in [4] that this integral is the "best integral" of Sard [5], [6], [7].

The function  $\bar{y}$  has the properties  $(\bar{y}, \bar{y}) = 1$  and  $\bar{y}(x_i) = 0$ ,  $i = 1, \dots, m$ . Of all functions  $y$  with these properties,

$$(2.2) \quad F(\bar{y}) \geq |F(y)|.$$

This problem was solved by Sard [5]. For the best integration formulas,

$$(2.3) \quad \left| \int_{x_1}^{x_m} f(x) dx - \sum_{i=1}^m A_i f(x_i) \right| \leq M^{1/2} \left[ \int_{x_1}^{x_m} K^2 dx \right]^{1/2},$$

where  $K$  is the Peano kernel. Thus

$$(2.4) \quad \int_{x_1}^{x_m} \bar{y} dx = \left[ \int_{x_1}^{x_m} K^2 dx \right]^{1/2} = \sqrt{K_2}.$$

For the functions  $y$ ,  $M = 1$  and  $y(x_i) = 0$ . Thus the maximum value  $F(y)$  can take on is  $\sqrt{K_2}$ . The kernel  $K^2$  was shown [8], [4] to be identical with the monospline whose roots are its knots  $x_1, \dots, x_m$  and for which  $x_1$  and  $x_m$  are roots of order  $2n$ . The monospline for this problem is

$$(2.5) \quad \bar{y} \sqrt{K_2} = \frac{1}{(2n-1)!} \left[ \frac{(x-x_1)^{2n}}{2n} + S_{2n-1}(x) \right].$$

Note that

$$(2.6) \quad F(\bar{y}) = \sqrt{K_2}.$$

Both  $\bar{u}$  and  $\bar{y}$  contain  $m + n - 1$  unknown coefficients. These may be determined by the  $m$  relations  $\bar{u}(x_i) = f_i$  and  $\bar{y}(x_i) = 0$  and the  $n - 1$  relations

$$\bar{u}^{(i)}(x_m) = y^{(i)}(x_m) = 0, \quad i = n, \dots, 2n - 2.$$

**3. Results.** We may compute the coefficients of the spline function  $\bar{u}$  by solving a system of linear equations. Let us define a matrix,

$$(3.1) \quad \mathbf{C} = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{D} & \mathbf{L} \\ \mathbf{H}^\top & \mathbf{0} \end{bmatrix},$$

where the superscript  $\top$  denotes transposition.  $\mathbf{D}$  is an  $(m - 1)$ -by- $(m - 1)$  order matrix with

$$(3.2) \quad D_{ij} = (x_{m+1-i} - x_j)_+^{2n-1},$$

where the subscript  $+$  is defined as follows:

$$(3.3) \quad (y)_+ = \begin{cases} y & y > 0, \\ 0 & y \leq 0, \end{cases}$$

$$(3.4) \quad L_{ij} = (x_{m+1-i} - x_1)^{n-j},$$

and

$$H_{ij} = (x_m - x_i)^{n-j},$$

and  $\mathbf{0}$  is an  $(n - 1)$ -by- $(n - 1)$  order null matrix. Let us further define vectors

$$(3.6) \quad \mathbf{F}_L = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{f}_L \\ \mathbf{0} \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{F}_H = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{f}_H \\ \mathbf{0} \end{bmatrix},$$

$$(3.7) \quad \mathbf{T}_L = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_L \\ \mathbf{d} \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{T}_H = \begin{bmatrix} \mathbf{P}_H \\ \mathbf{d} \end{bmatrix},$$

where

$$(3.8) \quad \mathbf{f}_L = \begin{bmatrix} f_m - f_1 \\ \vdots \\ f_2 - f_1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{f}_H = \begin{bmatrix} f_m - f_1 \\ \vdots \\ f_m - f_{m-1} \end{bmatrix},$$

$$(3.9) \quad \mathbf{P}_L = \begin{bmatrix} (x_m - x_1)^{2n}/2n \\ \vdots \\ (x_2 - x_1)^{2n}/2n \end{bmatrix}, \quad \mathbf{P}_H = \begin{bmatrix} (x_m - x_1)^{2n}/2n \\ \vdots \\ (x_m - x_{m-1})^{2n}/2n \end{bmatrix},$$

and

$$(3.10) \quad \mathbf{d} = \begin{bmatrix} (x_m - x_1)^n/n \\ \vdots \\ (x_m - x_1)^2/2 \end{bmatrix}.$$

In terms of these quantities the coefficients in  $\bar{u}$  are

$$(3.11) \quad a_i = [\mathbf{C}^{-1} \cdot \mathbf{F}_L]_i, \quad i = 1, \dots, n + m - 2,$$

where  $a_i$  is the coefficient of the term  $(x - x_i)_+^{2n-1}$  in  $\bar{u}$  when  $i < m$ , and it is the coefficient of the term  $(x - x_1)^{m+n-i-1}$  for  $i \geq m$ . Thus the best integral of  $f$  is

$$(3.12) \quad F(\bar{u}) = \mathbf{T}_H^\top \cdot \mathbf{C}^{-1} \cdot \mathbf{F}_L + (x_m - x_1)f_1$$

or, by symmetry,

$$(3.13) \quad F(\bar{u}) = \mathbf{F}_H^\top \cdot \mathbf{C}^{\top-1} \cdot \mathbf{T}_L + (x_m - x_1)f_m.$$

The maximum error bound for this integral is, by (1.10), (1.5) and (1.6),

$$(3.14) \quad \begin{aligned} E_{\text{best}} &= F(\bar{y})(r^2 - (\bar{u}, \bar{u}))^{1/2} \\ &= ((M - [\bar{u}, \bar{u}])K_2)^{1/2}. \end{aligned}$$

We may compute  $[\bar{u}, \bar{u}]$  by integration by parts:

$$(3.15) \quad \begin{aligned} [\bar{u}, \bar{u}] &= \int_{x_1}^{x_m} \bar{u}^{(n)} \bar{u}^{(n)} dx \\ &= (-1)^{n-1} \int_{x_1}^{x_m} \bar{u}^{(2n-1)} \bar{u}' dx \\ &= (-1)^{n-1} (2n-1)! \sum_{i=1}^{m-1} a_i (f_m - f_i) \\ &= (-1)^{n-1} (2n-1)! \mathbf{F}_H^T \cdot \mathbf{C}^{-1} \cdot \mathbf{F}_L. \end{aligned}$$

Since  $\bar{y}$  is a monospline with the same knots as the spline  $\bar{u}$  we may compute its coefficients in terms of the matrix  $\mathbf{C}$  also. From (2.5) and the fact that  $\bar{y}(x_i) = 0$  and  $x_1$  and  $x_m$  are zeros of multiplicity  $2n$ , we may compute the coefficients in  $S_{2n-1}$  of (2.5). Then upon integrating  $\bar{y}$  we obtain

$$(3.16) \quad F(\bar{y}) = \frac{(-1)^n}{[(2n-1)!]} \left[ \frac{(x_m - x_1)^{2n+1}}{2n(2n+1)} - \mathbf{T}_H^T \cdot \mathbf{C}^{-1} \cdot \mathbf{T}_L \right] \frac{1}{K_2^{1/2}} = K_2^{1/2}.$$

**4. Discussion.** We may obtain the coefficients for the best integration formulas by noticing that the functional values enter (3.12) linearly. Thus we may write

$$(4.1) \quad F(\bar{u}) = \sum_{i=1}^m W_i f_i,$$

where

$$(4.2) \quad W_{m+1-i} = (\mathbf{T}_H^T \cdot \mathbf{C}^{-1})_i, \quad i = 1, \dots, m-1,$$

and

$$(4.3) \quad W_1 = x_m - x_1 - \sum_{i=2}^m W_i.$$

Similar relations follow from (3.13).

When  $m = n$ , the best integration formulas are the same as those obtained by integrating the Lagrange interpolation coefficient. In this case  $[\bar{u}, \bar{u}] = 0$  and so the error bound is just the usual bound obtained from the Peano kernel. When  $[\bar{u}, \bar{u}] \neq 0$  the error bound (3.14) is better than the bound used by Sard [5], [6], [7], for these formulas.

In this paper we have discussed the error bound for integration. The spline function  $\bar{u}$  is the optimal approximation for any function in  $F_n[x_1, x_m]$  which passes through the *fixed points* and may be used for evaluating any linear functional. To find the optimal error bound it is only necessary to compute the corresponding  $\bar{y}$ . In this way we may find optimal error bounds for interpolation and differentiation. This will be discussed further in a future paper.

**Acknowledgment.** The author would like to thank the referee for calling to his attention a wealth of important literature on this subject.

Chemistry Department  
University of Illinois  
Urbana, Illinois

1. MICHAEL GOLOMB & H. F. WEINBERGER, "Optimal approximation and error bounds," *On Numerical Approximation*, R. E. LANGER (Ed.), Proceedings of a Symposium, Madison, April 21-23, 1958, Publ. No. 1 of the Mathematics Research Center, U. S. Army, Univ. of Wis., Univ. of Wis. Press, Madison, Wis., 1959, p. 117-190. MR 22, #12697.
2. J. L. WALSH, J. H. AHLBERG & E. N. NILSON, "Best approximation properties of the spline fit," *J. Math. Mech.*, v. 11, 1962, p. 225-234. MR 25 #738.
3. C. DE BOOR, "Best approximation properties of spline functions of odd degree," *J. Math. Mech.*, v. 12, 1963, p. 747-749. MR 27 #3982.
4. I. J. SCHOENBERG, "Spline interpolation and best quadrature formulae," *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.*, v. 70, 1964, p. 143-148. MR 28 #394.
5. ARTHUR SARD, "Best approximate integration formulas; best approximation formulas," *Amer. J. Math.*, v. 71, 1949, p. 80-91. MR 10, 576.
6. LEROY F. MEYERS & ARTHUR SARD, "Best approximate integration formulas," *J. Math. Phys.*, v. 29, 1950, p. 118-123. MR 12, 83.
7. ARTHUR SARD, *Linear Approximation*, Math. Surveys No. 9, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, R.I., 1963.
8. I. J. SCHOENBERG, "Spline functions, convex curves and mechanical quadrature," *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.*, v. 64, 1958, p. 352-357. MR 20 #7174.